

Averus Corporation Library Consulting

June 30, 2008

Mr. Larry Justiss
 Library Director
 Tom Green County Library
 112 West Beauregard Avenue
 San Angelo, Texas 76903

Subject: Evaluation of Proposal #08-028 – To Procure a Library RFID, Self-Check, Collection Security

Dear Larry:

Per your request, I have undertaken an evaluation of the responses to your Proposal #08-028 – To Procure a Library RFID, Self Check, Collection Security System. As you have undertaken to rehabilitate the current Hemphill-Wells Building in San Angelo into a new Central Library, we have assisted you in all phases of this library development. An important phase of these improvements is the development of new technologies for the future. The Library Technology Plan proposes that implementation and installation of a Radio Frequency Identification (RFID) System as a major component of that technology advancement.

You have released a Request for Proposal (RFP) which comprehensively details the need for RFID technology, provides standards, and determines quantitative measures in which to evaluate the various returned proposal, as well as determine the most cost effective pricing.

This evaluation with recommendation is designed to help you determine which proposed system best suits your current and future technology needs at the most cost effective price over the long term.

Cost Summary Table

Company	Total Bid Price	5 Year Annual Maintenance Total	Grand Total
Bibliotheca – Opt. A	\$142,450.00	\$35,600.00	\$178,050.00
Bibliotheca – Opt. B	\$141,255.00	\$35,600.00	\$176,855.00
EnvisionWare – Opt. 1A	\$178,359.50	\$43,835.32	\$222,194.82
EnvisionWare – Opt.1B	\$167,380.75	\$43,835.32	\$211,216.07
EnvisionWare – Opt. 2A	NA	NA	NA
EnvisionWare – Opt. 2B	\$153,706.75	\$35,881.36	\$189,588.11
EnvisionWare – Opt 2C* *Copper Tags	\$167,776.75	\$35,881.36	\$203,658.11
Libramation – Opt. A	\$144,830.00	\$23,112.00	\$167,942.00
Libramation – Opt. B	\$150,530.00	\$23,112.00	\$173,642.00
* Techlogic – Opt. A	\$138,121.15	\$40,866.34	\$178,987.49
Techlogic – Opt. B	\$138,521.15	\$40,866.34	\$179,387.49

111 Wild Horse Way
 Georgetown, Texas
 916-769-5401

\$142,549.40

Averus Corporation Library Consulting

3M – Opt. A	\$174,488.00	\$48,704.00	\$223,192.00
3M – Opt. B	\$165,336.00	\$48,704.00	\$214,040.00

* Option A proposes purchase of Portable Conversion Station. Option B proposes lease of Portable Conversion Station.

Evaluation Factors Table

	Bibliotheca	EnvisionWare	Libramation	Techlogic	3M
Suitability (65%)	55	65	50	65	50
Costs (30%)	20	15	25	30	10
Response (5%)	5	5	0	5	5
Total	80	85	75	100	65

Technical Evaluation

Bibliotheca RFID Library Systems AG

I found the Bibliotheca Proposal to be thorough and complete. Incorporated in 1996 as a wholly owned subsidiary of Bibliotheca RFID Library Systems AG of Cham, Switzerland, financial information is not publically available. Bibliotheca states that it has installed over 300 RFID library systems based upon ISO standards, the Danish Data Model (useful for downward compatibility and inter-library loan activity), and ergonomic hardware design. Service and maintenance is provided through a national service provider (not identified), and through 24 hour toll free number, web base and email support through the corporate offices in Pennsylvania, and support of international engineers in Switzerland.

The system is designed around its BiblioChip hardware and software technology, specifically designed by Bibliotheca. The Book RFID Tags contain 1024 bits of memory that identify and track the item. All hardware is ergonomically shaped and esthetic in appearance. However, the tags are the less expensive aluminum product, and the detection Gates while attractive are plain steel tubes much like your current Checkpoint product. I feel these elements lessen the quality of the proposal. The system is TLC compatible. The system is cost competitive as indicated by the Cost Summary Table above. It ranks 3rd in the Evaluation Factors Table. With the upgrade to copper tags, the cost competitiveness of the proposal is significantly reduced.

EnvisionWare

I found the EnvisionWare Proposal to be thorough and complete. EnvisionWare specializes in a RFID standards based system utilizing the Danish Data Model. Tom Green already has the PC Reservation system provided by EnvisionWare. The Renaissance system being proposed is compatible with the TLC system. The proposal also lists customers into the thousands as its reference base. Maintenance is supported by 24 hour/7 day support through free toll calls, email, and web site assistance. While this is

Averus Corporation Library Consulting

an excellent product, the system is not cost competitive as indicated by the Cost Summary Table above. Overall it ranks as the second quality level product as indicated in the Evaluation Factors Table above.

Libramation

I did not find the Libramation Proposal to be thorough and complete. While the proposal appears technically complete, it only agreed with the system requirements of the RFP. It also proposes a 256 bit based chip which I feel will be inadequate to the current and future building programming of the Tom Green County Library. The Product Configuration and Pricing tables were confusing and inaccurate in their presentations. On Page 1 of the Pricing section the Project Total was stated at \$144,830.00 with detailed costs following. On Page 7, Attachment 2 provided a Total for RFID System cost quote of \$153,383.80, and when the other costs were added, the cost should have been \$158,648.80. The Total Project Cost was stated at \$131,754.50. Since these two numbers are not compatible, I used the \$144,830 project amount as it seemed the most correct for evaluation. I determined that this is a small company from its financial information. I was not impressed with the proposed equipment such as the plastic detection gates with any accessories proposed as compared to the other proposals.

I cannot recommend this proposal as presented.

Techlogic

The Techlogic Proposal is thorough and complete to the RFP. Its corporate finances are adequate to sustain long term care of the system. Techlogic provides for a complete RFID system as identified in the RFP. Tags are 1024 bit based tags which are adequate to Tom Green County Library present and future operations. The system is an open standards system thus other vendors can interface with it. It is also compatible with the new selected TLC integrated library system. It also features custom furnishing capabilities that will mesh into the designs of the new Central Library. I believe this feature alone will save approximately \$20,000 in furniture acquisitions for the new Central Library. Specifically, the vendor included self-check tables within the proposals while providing competitive pricing. The detection gates are hard wood, and the proposal allows for many choices of finishes.

This proposal is cost competitive, and it is the highest ranking proposal in the above Evaluation Factors Table. I can recommend this proposal.

3M

The 3M proposal is thorough and complete. 3M provides RFID services to over 270 libraries worldwide. It has been a leading vendor in library item security for many decades. The brand of the company is well known, and it is substantial in its financial position. The tag memory bits were not stated. They only state that the RFID tags meet "ISO 15693-3 and 1800-3 mode 1 compliant and operate at 13.56 MHz frequency". The proposed system is a complete system and meets the standards of the RFP.

While an acceptable proposal, the system is not competitive as indicated by the above Cost Summary Table or the Evaluation Factors Table.

Averus Corporation Library Consulting

Recommendation

All of the responding systems will deliver RFID systems to the Tom Green Library. However when evaluated from a cost comparison, the evaluation factors criteria, and integration into the TLC integrated library system, I recommend the Option B of the Techlogic System.

The Techlogic proposal scored 100 on the Evaluation Factors Table. It is cost competitive. I do not feel it is necessary for the Tom Green County Library to purchase the Portable Conversion Table. The rental amount at \$325 per month for six months should achieve the conversion objectives of the project. Additionally, Techlogic is a sister company of TLC, and compatibility and cooperation between the two companies will be highly effective. Furthermore, Techlogic offers custom design of the furnishing aspects to meet customer design requirements. I indicated earlier that this feature should save approximately \$20,000 in the Central Library furniture and fixtures acquisition costs.

Again, I recommend you negotiate with Techlogic for your RFID System.

Most Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "David Price".

David Price, Principal
Averus Corporation